

~~IN-CONFIDENCE~~

## QUESTION TIME BRIEF

## Why the Government doesn't turn SIEVs around?

## Key messages/Talking Points

- The "turning back" of suspected irregular entry vessels when they are intercepted, either inside or outside Australia's contiguous zone, presents several practical difficulties.
- For a suspected irregular entry vessel to be turned back and sent to Indonesia, the Indonesian Government would need to agree to the people returning to Indonesia.
  - The Indonesian Government has already indicated it is unlikely to agree to the "shuffling of vessels" between Australian and Indonesian waters because it does not address the issue of people smuggling.
- There are also serious issues relating to the reaction of people onboard boats being "turned back" to Indonesia.
- It is likely that the people onboard these vessels would begin to sabotage the vessels, putting lives at risk, including Australian lives.
- The events onboard SIEV 36 in April 2009, when five people lost their lives and dozens were injured, is a tragic example of the dramatic and deadly consequences when people onboard these vessels believe they have to return to Indonesia.
- In addition, unless escorted all the way to Indonesia, there would be nothing to stop the people on these vessels from turning around and then trying again to reach the Australian mainland.

Cleared by: [REDACTED] Acting Deputy Commander, Border Protection  
Command

Work: [REDACTED] s47F  
Mob: [REDACTED]

Action Officer: [REDACTED], Director Governance & Command Support, BPC

[REDACTED] s47F

Date Created: 20 September 2010

Date Reviewed: 1 February 2011

Equivalent MOB ref number:

~~IN-CONFIDENCE~~

**IN-CONFIDENCE****Background**

The Howard Government returned a number of vessels to the contiguous zone adjacent to Indonesia. This was done on the basis of the doctrine of acquiescence under international law. Indonesia was informed by diplomatic note that a vessel was about to be returned. If no response was given to the diplomatic note then Indonesia was taken to have acquiesced in an action which otherwise would have required Indonesian agreement under international law.

Efforts were made to ensure that the vessels were seaworthy. The vessels were escorted back to the Indonesian contiguous zone and were left with enough fuel to enable them to reach the Indonesian shore.

The Government has been advised that the return of vessels to Indonesia absent of Indonesian consent would be inconsistent with Australia's international obligations. It would also place lives at risk.

**Other Challenges**

Most vessels intercepted do not have adequate navigation equipment and a number of the vessels are likely not to have capable mariners on board. To ensure the safety of those on board it is likely that they would have to be escorted. If an Australian Government vessel was to escort a vessel back to Indonesia, it would therefore need to enter Indonesian waters with the vessel that was "turned back". The Indonesian Government would have to agree to this.

Even if there was consent to the vessel being "turned back", Border Protection Command notes that when it boards these vessels, nearly all of the vessels are found in a poor condition and poorly maintained. It is therefore difficult in many situations to properly determine that the vessel would be seaworthy enough to allow the vessel to continue on without the loss of life.

As such "turning back" vessels that are considered to be seaworthy would require an Australian Government vessel to escort the vessel to Indonesian waters where the people are left with enough safety equipment such as life jackets and navigational equipment, food and fuel to reach the Indonesian mainland. This would mean an Australian Government vessel would have to carry enough supplies for these vessels, and would [REDACTED] s 37(2)(b)

**Law of the Sea**

The key Convention to apply in such situations is the United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea. Under this Convention and customary international law, with some limited exceptions Australia cannot intercept nor have control of foreign flagged vessels on the high seas. The most relevant exception is the permission of the flag State. If a vessel is to be returned to Indonesia, the permission of the flag State would be required.

In most cases, the flag State of the vessel is Indonesian and therefore Indonesian permission (or acquiescence) would be required. If the vessel is flagged to a State other than Indonesia, the permission of that State would also be required. Also, as a matter of policy, it would be appropriate to seek Indonesia's agreement to the return of the vessel to its contiguous zone irrespective of its flag status.

**IN-CONFIDENCE**

**IN-CONFIDENCE**

As a matter of international law, the Australian Government would be under a 'duty of care' obligation to ensure that the vessel is in a seaworthy condition, that it complied with all the rules concerning equipment (including life jackets etc), that it had enough fuel and supplies and that it was capable of reaching the place to which it is being returned. If it is believed and the vessel is likely to be sabotaged, then a return should not proceed as it would soon become a safety of life at sea situation.

**Refugee and human rights law**

A vessel could only be returned from where it came if Australia was satisfied that it would not be in breach of its obligations under the Refugee Convention and international human rights conventions, such as the Convention Against Torture, in so doing. The principle obligation is that of non-refoulement.

In the case of a return to Indonesia, Australia would need to be satisfied that Indonesia would not send the persons being returned to yet another country where they claim they would be subject to persecution or the death penalty, arbitrary deprivation of life, torture or cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment (non-refoulement obligation). Secondly, Australia would also need to be satisfied that their refugee status was capable of being assessed in Indonesia.

**IN-CONFIDENCE**